

# Information to Assist with the Development of the Cave Creek Fire Protection Plan

---

February 16, 2021



# Overview/Sections

Background and History

Goals, Requirements and Options

Estimated Budget Impacts

# Background and History

- 1968 (approx.) Rural/Metro Coverage – Individual Subscriptions
- 2005 Cave Creek Complex Fire
- 2008 Citizens Fire Coverage Options Advisory Committee - Report
- 2020 East Desert Fire
- 2020 Ocotillo Fire
- 2020 Public Safety Resource Management - Report
- 2020 Town of Cave Creek and Scottsdale IGA

# Background and History

## Rural Metro – Cave Creek

- Initial coverage for the foothills area began in approx. 1968 from a leased station at the SW Corner of Tom Darlington and Cave Creek.
- Second RM leased station, located at 37402 N. Cave Creek Rd. began operations in 2005.
- Service has always been individual voluntary subscription with residents and business owners.
- Current subscription percentage between 40% to 50%. Less than ½ of Cave Creek residents/business financially support the emergency services for the area.
- No master contract or contractual agreement with the Town.
- Intermittent “Mutual Aid” agreements – not member of “Auto Aid”



# Background and History

## Community Evaluations & Reports

- **November 2008 (Report)**
  - Fire Coverage Options Advisory Committee – Primary Recommendations
    - Enter into a master contract or IGA for future emergency service.
    - Identify potential tax ballot measure for sustainable revenue stream.
    - Recommend two (2) community owned fire stations.
    - Request quarterly reports from R/M on community activities.
- **August 2020 (Report)**
  - Public Safety Resource Management (PSRM – K. Rosche) evaluation of current system and potential options and costs for future service
- **December 2020**
  - Town of Cave Creek and City of Scottsdale IGA – Auto Aid Review

# Background and History

## Previous Major Incidents

- Cave Creek Complex Fire: June 2005 - 248,310 Acres – Started in COS
  - Exposures to COS, Tonto Hills, Carefree and Cave Creek
  - Mutual Aid with SFD, Phx, RM, Tonto NF and Az DFFM
- Buffalo Chip Fire: November 2015
  - Mutual Aid with R/M, PFD, SFD
- East Desert Fire: May 2020 - 1,492 Acres – Started in Cave Creek
  - Mutual/Auto Aid with R/M, D/Mtn, PFD, SFD, Az DFFM & Tonto NF
- Ocotillo Fire: May 2020 - 980 Acres – Started in Cave Creek
  - Mutual/Auto Aid with R/M, Az DFFM, D/Mtn, PFD, SFD & Tonto NF
- Feed Store Fire: May 2020
  - R/M only – No Mutual Aid



# Goals, Requirements and Options

## Primary Goals

- Evaluate the Cave Creek Community Impact on the Regional Automatic Aid System
- Identify Requirements for Inclusion with the Auto Aid System
  - Specific measures and associated estimated costs
- Review Community Options
  - Assess current and potential Cave Creek protection Model(s)

# Goals, Requirements and Options

## Outreach and Automatic Aid Overview

### Area Stakeholder Contacts

- R/M Fire Chief(s) Brian Davis; John Kraetz
- Az DFFM – C. Peters, J. Truett, D. Willis
- PV Town Attorney Debby Roberson
- AFDA Executive Director John Flynn
- M/County Parks Director R.J. Cardin
- Rio Verde Fire Chief Jay Ducote
- Guadalupe Fire Chief Wayne Clement
- PSRM Principal Kevin Roche
- Zoom meeting with League of Cities and CM/W Phoenix, Peoria, Glendale, Scottsdale
- Phoenix Fire Chief Kara Kalkbrenner
- Scottsdale Fire Chief Tom Shannon
- Daisy Mtn. Fire Chief Brian Tobin
- Glendale Fire Chief Terry Garrison
- Mesa Fire Chief Mary Cameli
- Peoria Fire Chief Bobby Ruiz
- AFMA Fire Chief Rob Biscoe
- Sun City Fire Chief Ron Deadman



# Goals, Requirements and Options

## Primary Requirements to Participate in the Auto Aid System

- Article 1.1 Purpose To provide a highly efficient, effective and mutually beneficial relationship among multiple regional jurisdictions to provide for the overall public safety of the region through an Automatic Aid System. This agreement will continue to allow for an automatic response of the closest, most appropriate fire department/district resources.
- Article 1.2 Authority The Parties acknowledge that this Agreement is being entered into pursuant to the Intergovernmental Agreement Statute ("IGA"), Section 11-952, Arizona Revised Statutes ("ARS").
- Article 2 Eligibility Standards and Requirements To be eligible to participate in the Automatic Aid System, a Participant shall meet the standards and requirements set forth in this Article at all times during the Term of this Agreement. Any Participant failing to meet these eligibility standards and requirements is subject to removal from the Automatic Aid System, as prescribed herein.
- Article 2.2 Standard Service Requirements Participants in this Agreement agree to the following standard service requirements as the primary response system elements
- Article 2.2 A Communication and Dispatch All Participants must be a part of the Phoenix Fire Regional Dispatch System or the Mesa Fire Regional Dispatch System; These Systems will use a Computer Aided Dispatch ("CAD") System that automatically selects the closest, most appropriate Participant(s) unit(s) for dispatch;  
  
All Participants must also be a member or have a plan to become a member of the Phoenix Regional Wireless cooperative ("PRWC") or the Topaz Regional Wireless Cooperative ("TRWC") within one (1) year of entry.



# Goals, Requirements and Options

## Primary Requirements to Participate in the Auto Aid System

- Article 2.2 A(1)    The CAD (Computer Aided Dispatch) system                      Will dispatch the closest appropriate unit regardless of jurisdiction... utilizing Automatic Vehicle Location (AVL) equipment ..... and a computerized Geographic Information System (GIS).
- Article 2.2 C        Incident Management and Minimum Company Standards                      Participants shall use the same set of procedures for Incident Management and Minimum Company Standards according to Volume II, Standard Operating Procedures Phoenix Fire Department or the Mesa Fire and Medical Department Standard Operations Procedures 200 Series....Officers that operate in an Operational Command capacity are required to attend at least 50% of the Command Officer training curriculum offered by the Phoenix Fire Department.
- Article 2.2 E        Compatible Equipment    To ensure compatibility of equipment, Participants shall maintain an inventory of equipment (based on National Fire Protection Association "NFPA" standards).
- Article 2.2 H        Staffing Levels    Full staffing as described in NFPA 1710 on engines and ladders provides the most efficient and effective personnel safety and service delivery to the public. The minimum daily staffing level for all engines and ladders shall be four (4) members, which is "full staffing" under NFPA 1710.

\* special note there may be some temporary, but not permanent relief from this requirement.



# Goals, Requirements and Options

## Primary Requirements to Participate in the Auto Aid System

- Article 2.2 I Minimum Firefighter Training Standards To ensure safety, baseline knowledge and a consistent approach to performing tactical operations, all participants agree to require that all emergency response employees receive initial firefighter recruit training through a recognized regional fire training academy. The four (4) currently recognized regional fire training academies are Phoenix, Mesa, Glendale and Chandler
- Article 2.3 Reciprocity: No Guaranty of Perfect Equity Participants agree that Automatic Aid is reciprocal. This does not ensure that all jurisdictions will exactly match the amount of aid given and received. However, to the greatest degree possible the system will maintain general equity among all Participants
- Article 2.4 Ownership of Property and Equipment Each Participant shall retain ownership of any equipment or property it brings to the performance of the Agreement and shall retain ultimate control of its employees
- Article 2.5 No Reimbursement for Services Except as specifically agreed to by the Parties involved in a specific incident, none of the involved Parties shall be reimbursed by any of the others for costs incurred in responding pursuant to this agreement. However, in the event of formally declared disasters, participants may directly apply for reimbursements from County, State and/or Federal agencies as appropriate.
- Article 3.1 Life Safety Council The Purpose of the "Life Safety Council" is to ensure the effective and efficient operation of the Automatic Aid System. Each Participant is a member (voting) of the Life Safety Council and is expected to participate in scheduled meetings

# Goals, Requirements and Options

- Make No Changes - Status Quo
- Require Membership from Community Residents/Business or Establish a Master Contract with Rural Metro
- Create a new Regional Fire District or possibly Annex into an existing Fire District
- Develop and install a stand-alone Town of Cave Creek Fire Department
- Contract for Fire/ALS Service with an Auto Aid Provider

# Goals, Requirements and Options Make No Changes – Status Quo

## General Description

- Voluntary Subscription/Membership Model
- Individual contracts between customers and provider
- No real Town direction or involvement
- Current Town and RM Model

## Comments

- Only less than half participate and leaves much of town “unprotected”
- Follow-up costs to individual residents and/or Town can be significant
- No Initial Costs to the Town
- Town Remains Liable for Larger Incidents
- No Automatic Aid
- Unsustainable due to growth of town and potential impacts on surrounding communities

# Goals, Requirements and Options Require Membership from Community Residents/Business or Master Contract with Rural Metro

## General Description

- Town would need to require subscriptions/membership to identified 3<sup>rd</sup> party provider (RM)
- Possible opportunity to set service levels with provider
- Master Contract with Rural Metro
  - Town could establish service levels and a contract to pay for Town protection
- Need to guard against some type of Fragmented or Disjointed solution

## Comments

- Local ordinance changes required to mandate payments to 3<sup>rd</sup> party provider or to establish a reliable revenue stream for expected costs
- Question the need to establish an enforcement program for payments (Town/Provider)
- Town liability remains for larger fire incidents
- Possible/Questionable Mutual Aid or Regional Partner participation
- No Automatic Aid

# Goals, Requirements and Options

Create a new Regional Fire District or Possibly Annex into an Existing Fire District

## General Description

- Fire District establishment process has extensive “statutory” requirements
- Similar requirements for both new and annexation options
- Town approval initially required, but follow-up responsibility shifts to another elected 3<sup>rd</sup> party
- Guarantees that all residents and property owners participate and pay for the service
- Can be regional or individual Towns

## Comments

- Need both Town and County Supervisors approval to initiate any process
- Requires initial signature gathering (approx. 1 year) along with 50% + property and voter approval
- Requires property taxes, rates and service levels controlled by 3<sup>rd</sup> party elected body
- Revenue source must be established (primary/secondary property tax)
- Extensive initial process (\$100K+ and time) with little to no guarantee of success

# Goals, Requirements and Options

## Develop and Install a Stand-Alone Cave Creek Town Fire Department

### General Description

- Town would be fully engaged and be responsible for Fire/Emergency Service coverage
- Revenue stream would be the full responsibility of the Town and Elected Officials
- Would include evaluation for the possible establishment of capital resources and dedicated funding

### Comments

- Need to identify all staffing and overhead needs and internal programs to establish to fill all fire department positions
- Potential for a very extended timeline needed for training, capital and equipment acquisition
- Increased on-going costs to the Town for overhead positions, required certifications and training of personnel
- Town needs to be seen as a good partner and must still meet all requirements of the Regional Auto Aid contract
- Would still need increased access to regional, specialty resources (haz mat/TRT/wildland)
- Still “Required” to be voted into the Auto Aid system by current partners



# Goals, Requirements and Options Contract for Fire/ALS Service with an Automatic Aid Provider

## General Description

- Town would be fully engaged and be responsible for Fire/Emergency Service coverage with an existing Auto Aid Member
- Would include evaluation for the possible establishment of capital resources and dedicated funding
- Revenue stream would be the full responsibility of the Town and Elected Officials

## Comments

- Initial contract example would be a Paradise Valley type of model
- Town required to be seen as a good “Long-Term” partner
- Must meet all of the requirements of the Regional Auto Aid contract
- Increased access to regional, specialty resources (haz mat/TRT/wildland)
- Still “Required” to be voted into the system by current partners
- Increased opportunity for earlier entry into the regional Auto Aid System

# Estimated/Potential Budget Impacts

## Automatic Aid Overview

### Auto Aid Requirements

- Articles 1.1/1.2/2/2.2
  - Purpose/Authority/Eligibility/Standards
- Article 2.2A/2.2 A1
  - Comms Dispatch & CAD
  - Required Dispatch from Phoenix Regional or Mesa Regional Dispatch Centers
  - Required to be a member of a Regional Wireless Cooperative
  - Dispatch of closest most appropriate unit(resource) using Automatic Vehicle Locator (AVL) equipment and based on computerized Geographic Information System (GIS)

### Estimated Costs

- Local Legislative/Ord. & Contract Development
  - Authority and Revenue Opportunities
  - Town and Legal Review of Contracts
- Initial Technology, Stations and Vehicles
  - Approx. \$262,600
- Annual Auto Aid/AVL/GIS Dispatch Costs
  - Approx. \$82,500
- Sub Total CAD, Radio and Dispatch
  - Approx. \$345,100



# Estimated/Potential Budget Impacts

## Automatic Aid Overview

### Auto Aid Requirements

- Article 2.2 C
  - Incident Management and Standard Operating Procedures
    - Phx FD Volume II or Mesa MFMD 200
    - Command Officers attend min 50% of Officer Training
- Article 2.2 E
  - Maintain an equipment inventory consistent with NFPA standards

### Estimated Costs

- Provides for Consistent Command of Emergency Scenes.
  - Goal to provide effective and safe emergency scenes for personnel and customers
  - Allows for rapid deployment and increased interoperability of system resources
- Estimated Vehicle Equipment Costs
  - Engine Company      \$200,000 - \$275,000
  - Brush Vehicle        \$75,000 - \$100,000
  - Tender Vehicle        \$40,000 - \$50,000

# Estimated/Potential Budget Impacts

## Automatic Aid Overview

### Auto Aid Requirements

- Article 2.2 E
  - Maintain an equipment inventory consistent with NFPA standards

### Estimated Costs

- Estimated Fire Vehicle Costs
  - Engine Company (1250 GPM + 5/700 Gal)
    - New \$650K - \$850K
    - Used \$250K - \$450K
    - Leased \$140K - 5yr Lease to own
  - Brush Vehicle
    - New \$180K - \$300K
    - Used \$100K - \$150K
    - Leased \$48K - 5yr Lease to own
  - Water Tender Vehicle
    - New \$250K - \$450K
    - Used \$150K - \$250K
    - Leased \$55K - 5yr Lease to own

# Estimated/Potential Budget Impacts

## Automatic Aid Overview

### Auto Aid Requirements

- Articles 2.2 H
  - Required minimum staffing levels per NFPA 1710 – 4 Persons
  - Capt., Engineer, Two Firefighters
    - Min 12 to 15 people for 24/7 coverage
    - Projected 6/8 staff ALS/Medic certified
- Article 2.2. I
  - Minimum training standards – recruit attend recognized regional training academy (Phx/Mesa/Chand/Glen)
  - Per ISO Min 20 hours/yr each for sworn personnel
  - Per ADHS – EMT 20 hrs/yr and ALS 40 hrs/yr
- Article 2.3
  - Reciprocity: No Guarantee of Perfect Equity

### Estimated Costs

- Costs for one 4-person unit
  - Annual payroll \$1.6 to \$2.2 Million (+OH)
  - Initial PPE turnout gear \$50K to \$55K (15 people)
- Required Training
  - Initial Recruit Training approx. \$60K to \$70K (\$4,500 ea. Plus RTO 5/1)
  - Academy time approx. 14 weeks
  - Medic training time approx. 11-12 months
- Understood that all Jurisdictions cannot equally match the amount of aid given or received
  - Goal to maintain general equity among participants while still supporting overall system
  - Commitment to be a participant and those underlying costs will cover any additional charges

# Estimated/Potential Budget Impacts

## Automatic Aid Overview

### Auto Aid Requirements

- Article 2.4
  - Ownership of Property & Equip
- Article 2.5
  - No Reimbursement for Services
- Article 3.1
  - Life Safety Council Mission

### Estimated Costs

- Participants shall retain ownership of equipment or resources and ultimate control of its employees
- System participants shall not be reimbursed for costs, with the possible exception of formally declared disasters
- Goal to ensure effective and efficient emergency operations for Auto Aid Participants without regard to jurisdictional boundaries.
- Participants must bring value to the system, and be invited and approved for inclusion into the Automatic Aid System

# Potential Budget Impacts

## Estimated Start-up/Capital Costs

- Largest Outstanding Question is a Facility
  - Lease existing Still TBD
  - Purchase existing facility Still TBD
  - Purchase new land Estimated \$350K - \$500K
  - Establish new facility (modular/temp) \$350K - \$450K
  - Establish new facility \$4.5 mil to \$5.6 mil
- New Engine/Vehicle
  - Purchase \$650K - \$850K
  - Lease \$140K - \$150K Per year
  - Equipment \$280K - \$320K
  - Personal Protective Equip (PPE) \$50K - \$55K
  - Other - Service/Maint. Still TBD
- Initial Auto-Aid Technology
  - Technology, AVL, Radio, GIS, Dispatch \$262K - \$270K

# Potential Budget Impacts

## Estimated Annual Operational Costs

- |                                      |                              |
|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| • Land/Facility                      | Still TBD                    |
| • Vehicle                            | Still TBD                    |
| • Annual Dispatch Costs              |                              |
| • Based on Call Volume/System Maint. | \$82,500                     |
| • Annual Personnel Costs             |                              |
| • One Station (4-person staffing)    | \$1.6 - \$2.2 million (+ OH) |
| • Personnel is a 25 yr commitment    |                              |
| • Contingency (PV)                   |                              |
| • OT, Training, Utilities, Other     | \$100K - \$250K              |



# Next Steps

- Clear Direction/Guidance From Council
  - Establish the Level of Town Commitment and Future Resources
  - Identify the Most Viable Town Option
  - Possible Council Resolution to Enter into Auto Aid System
  - Obtain/Develop a Facility or Property Plan
  - Identify Budget Options and Future Funding Opportunities
- Work with DFFM to Establish Town Fire Service ID # and Develop a Cooperative Plan for the Upcoming Fire Season
- Develop and Initiate Wildland Fire Season, Town Outreach Programs
- Potential Future Grant Opportunities and/or Mutual Aid Options

